

4th Meeting of the Sessional Committee of the CMS Scientific Council (ScC-SC4)

Bonn, Germany, 12-15 November 2019

UNEP/CMS/ScC-SC4/Doc.11.3.2

DISAGGREGATION OF BIRD FAMILIES AND GENERA LISTED UNDER APPENDIX II

(as at 31 August 2019/Prepared by Stephen Garnett)

Summary:

Appendix II of the CMS lists 63 bird families and three genera rather than individual species. The species within these families have been identified under the taxonomy of the Handbook of the Birds of the World (HBW) which was adopted by the 12th Meeting of the Conference of the Parties (COP12) as the standard for CMS.

Using data from the Handbook of the Birds of the World, an assessment has also been made of the extent to which each species within these families and genera meets the criteria for listing under Appendix II of the CMS, using the Guidelines agreed at COP11 (Resolution 11.33 [Rev.COP12]). Advice is sought on whether the families and genera currently aggregated on Appendix II can be delineated as including only those species that fall within those aggregated families and genera that currently meet the CMS criteria or whether all or a subset of those species should be retained for reference without amending the Appendices.

DISAGGREGATION OF BIRD FAMILIES LISTED UNDER APPENDIX II

1. Through adoption of Resolution 12.27 *Taxonomy and Nomenclature* the 12th Meeting of the Conference of the Parties agreed to recognize and use as the basis on which the CMS Appendices and amendments be adopted as the standard references for Non-passerine species the list of Del Hoyo, J. & Collar, N.J. (2014). Handbook of the Birds of the World and BirdLife International Illustrated Checklist of the Birds of the World. Volume 1: Non - passerines. Lynx Edicions, Barcelona and, for Passerine species, the list of Del Hoyo, J. & Collar, N.J. (2016). Handbook of the Birds of the World and BirdLife International Illustrated Checklist of the Birds of the World. Volume 2: Passerines. Lynx Edicions, Barcelona.
2. As a consequence of this resolution, 2,809 species were identified as belonging to the disaggregated bird families listed under Appendix II of CMS. Of these 50 have already been listed as species under Appendix II.
3. Assessments were made of the remaining 2,759 species using the listing criteria agreed at COP11, which form the basis of the *Guidelines for Assessment of Appendix I and II Listing Proposals* (Res.11.33; Rev.COP12).
4. To help clarify which of the 2,759 species might be eligible for listing under Appendix II, a three-step process was followed (see attachments):
 - i. The distributional databases of BirdLife International and Avibase were interrogated to determine whether species occur in more than one country;
 - ii. For those that do, the extent of overlap between breeding and non-breeding ranges was assessed to determine whether there is any potential for a significant proportion of the members of a species to move cyclically and predictably cross one or more national jurisdictional boundaries; [more detail to be provided for inclusion here, or as an appendix]
 - iii. The IUCN Red List status of each species was identified
5. From this analysis it is apparent that many species do not meet the CMS criteria for inclusion on Appendix II.
- ~~6. While this may not matter – Resolution 3.1 (Revised COP12) states that that the migratory species covered by higher taxa listings already in Appendix II need only be identified when Agreements are being prepared – parties to agreements may also wish to know whether species in agreements meet the CMS criteria~~
- ~~7.6.~~ To meet the CMS criteria a species must be considered migratory under the definition of Article I, section 1.a of the Convention which states that "Migratory species" means the entire population or any geographically separate part of the population of any species or lower taxon of wild animals, a significant proportion of whose members cyclically and predictably cross one or more national jurisdictional boundaries.
- ~~8.7.~~ However, 832 species in the disaggregated families are endemic to a single country
- ~~9.8.~~ A further 754 species are sedentary species for which there is no evidence that a significant proportion of the population cyclically and predictably crosses one or more national jurisdictional boundaries.
- ~~10.9.~~ Article IV of the Convention also states that Appendix II shall list migratory species which have *an unfavourable conservation status* and which require international agreements for their conservation and management, as well as those which have a conservation status which would significantly benefit from the international co-operation that could be achieved by an international agreement. This would include Data Deficient species.

- 44.10. In the disaggregated families 2,155 species are listed as Least Concern under the IUCN Red List criteria, so it might be assumed that they have a *favourable conservation status*. Among these species are 1,260 species for which a significant proportion of the population does not cyclically and predictably cross one or more national jurisdictional boundaries.
- 42.11. However, while the current guidelines to assess listing proposals suggest that a species assessed as Least Concern should normally not be considered for listing, the guidelines that apply to new proposals do not automatically apply to this disaggregation exercise, though they can inform it. This consideration is particularly relevant to the essentially sedentary leaving 895 that are Least Concern but with a significant proportion of the population cyclically and predictably crossing one or more national jurisdictional boundaries.
- 43.12. Included among those that could be considered for not including under Appendix II are 134 species listed under other CMS instruments. Of these, 132 do not have an unfavourable conservation status although all have a significant proportion of the population cyclically and predictably crossing one or more national jurisdictional boundaries. Of the remaining two species, the Vulnerable Maccoa Duck *Oxyura maccoa* moves only within South Africa and the Near Threatened Mountain Buzzard *Buteo oreophilus* is sedentary.
- 44.13. The remaining 83 species belong to disaggregated families, meet the CMS criteria and have an unfavourable conservation status but are not Extinct (see Annex).
- 45.14. Among the 83 species are 36 partial migrants. While these ostensibly meet the CMS criteria, range states may need to agree to what extent the movement across their borders represents a significant proportion of the members of a species.
- 46.15. In addition to the disaggregated families, the family Gruidae has three genera that are aggregated under Appendix II – *Antigone*, *Anthropoides* and *Grus* of which two species meet the CMS criteria, are not already listed as species on the Appendix and have an unfavourable conservation status: Asian populations of *Antigone antigone* and *Grus americana* (see Annex).
- 47.16. Of the four species in the genus *Antigone*, *A. vipio* is listed under Appendix I but not Appendix II, *A. canadensis* is highly migratory but Least Concern; *A. rubicunda* may cross international borders but is also Least Concern; and *A. antigone* is Vulnerable and has two subspecies that meet the CMS movement criteria but a third subspecies, *A. a. gillae*, is endemic to Australia so Australia should not be considered a range state for this species.
- 48.17. Of the two species of *Anthropoides*, a significant proportion of the population of *A. paradiseus* does not cross international borders; and *A. virgo* is highly migratory but Least Concern.
- 49.18. Of the five species in the genus *Grus*, *G. japonica*, *G. monacha* and *G. nigricollis* are listed under Appendix I but not Appendix II; *G. americana* is highly migratory and Endangered; and *G. grus* is highly migratory but is Least Concern. *G. grus* is included on the Agreement on the Conservation of African-Eurasian Migratory Waterbirds (AEWA).
- ~~20. Advice is sought from the Scientific Council on how to present this information to the Parties for potential action. The following alternatives are available as recommendations for the species in the disaggregated families and the aggregated genera in Gruidae:~~
- ~~i. Retain families as listed, noting that Res. 3.1 (Rev.COP12) states that the migratory species covered by higher taxa listings already in Appendix II need only be identified when Agreements were being prepared. This means retaining the full list as a reference for any future need (e.g. development of Agreements; Range State list;~~

- national reporting) without formally amending the Appendices;
- ii. ~~Replace family names with those of the 83 species that belong to the families currently aggregated under Appendix II that have an unfavourable conservation status and, after consultation with range states, are determined to be eligible under the CMS criteria;~~
 - iii. ~~Disseminate full list of species to Parties for consultation on which species, if any, should be named in the Appendices;~~
 - iv. ~~Delete any species in a disaggregated family unless there is a full nomination for inclusion on Appendix II~~
 - v. ~~Delete listings of *Antigone* spp., *Anthropoides* spp. and *Grus* spp., add *Antigone antigone* (excluding subspecies *gillae*) and *Grus americana* to Appendix II, and specifically do not list *Antigone canadensis*, *A. rubicunda*, *Anthropoides paradiseus*, *A. virgo* and *G. grus* that are currently included by implication.~~

Recommended Actions

The Sessional Committee is recommended to:

- a) ~~Review the list of bird species that belong to the families currently aggregated under Appendix II that meet the CMS criteria;~~
- b) ~~Consider whether the IUCN Red List status be considered in making recommendations on which species to retain on Appendix II;~~
- c) ~~Agree on the specific bird species that are eligible to be included on Appendix II, and their relevant range states; and~~
- d) ~~Decide on the most appropriate approach on how to present this information and the actions to recommend to the Conference of the Parties.~~

Following discussion of the of Document 11.3.2 on the disaggregation of bird families and genera listed under Appendix II the Sessional Committee therefore

Endorses the approach taken by the elected Councillors for Birds to

- disaggregating the families
- assessing whether they meet the CMS criteria for mobility

Commends the detailed list to the Conference of the Parties

Notes that there are 83 species that belong to the families and the 2 species that belong to *Gruidae* genera currently aggregated under Appendix II that have been judged to have an unfavourable conservation status (i.e. those species not assessed as Least Concern) and are determined to be eligible under the CMS criteria;

Notes that there are 1,173 species that belong to the families and the 5 species that belong to *Gruidae* genera currently aggregated under Appendix II that have been judged as eligible under the CMS criteria, regardless of the IUCN Red List status;

Suggests to the Conference of the Parties that the alternative approaches to dealing with the information now available to them include:

- Retaining families as listed, noting that Res. 3.1 (Rev.COP12) states that the migratory species covered by higher taxa listings already in Appendix II need only be identified when Agreements were being prepared. This means retaining the full list as a reference for any future need (e.g. development of Agreements; Range State list; national reporting) without formally amending the Appendices;

- Replacing family names with those of the species that belong to the families and genera currently aggregated under Appendix II that have been judged to have an unfavourable conservation status (i.e. those species not assessed as Least Concern) and, after consultation with range states, are determined to be eligible under the CMS criteria;
- Replacing family names with those of the species that belong to the families and genera currently aggregated under Appendix II that have been judged as eligible under the CMS criteria, regardless of the IUCN Red List status;
- Deleting any species in a disaggregated family unless there is a full nomination for inclusion on Appendix II